

A generation time effect on the rate of molecular evolution in invertebrates.

Research Article

Authors: Jessica A. Thomas^{abc*}, John, J. Welch^{bd*}, Robert Lanfear^{bc} and Lindell Bromham^{bc}

Research was performed at: the University of Sussex, the Australian National University and the University of Edinburgh.

Author affiliation: ^a Department of Ecology, Evolution & Natural Resources, Rutgers University, Cook Campus, 114 College Farm Road, New Brunswick, NJ 08901, USA. ^b Centre for the Study of Evolution, School of Life Sciences, University of Sussex, East Sussex BN1 2LE, UK; ^c Centre for Macroevolution and Macroecology, Research School of Biology, Building 116 Daley Road, Australian National University, Canberra, ACT 0200, Australia; ^d Institute for Evolutionary Biology, University of Edinburgh, Kings Buildings, Ashworth Laboratories, West Mains Road, Edinburgh EH9 3JT, UK;

* These authors contributed equally to this manuscript

Corresponding author: Jessica A. Thomas, Department of Ecology, Evolution & Natural Resources, Rutgers University, Cook Campus, 14 College Farm Road, New Brunswick, NJ 08901, USA. email: jthomas@aesop.rutgers.edu

Keywords: generation time, nearly neutral theory, phylogenetic comparative methods, substitution rate, genetic draft, effective population size

Running Head: A generation time effect on invertebrate molecular evolution.

Abbreviations: GT: Generation Time; mtDNA: mitochondrial DNA, rRNA: ribosomal RNA.

Abstract

The rate of genome evolution varies significantly between species. Evidence is growing that at least some of this variation is associated with species characteristics, such as body size, diversification rate or population size. One of the strongest correlates of the rate of molecular evolution in vertebrates is generation time: species with faster generation turnover tend to have higher rates of molecular evolution, presumably because their genomes are copied more frequently and therefore collect more DNA replication errors per unit time. But the generation time effect has never been tested for non-vertebrate animals. Here we present the first general test of the generation time effect in invertebrates, using 15 genes from 143 species spread across the major eumetazoan superphyla (including arthropods, nematodes, molluscs, annelids, platyhelminthes, cnidarians, echinoderms and urochordates). We find significant evidence that rates of molecular evolution are correlated with generation time in invertebrates, and that this effect applies consistently across genes, and taxonomic groups. Furthermore, the generation time effect is evident in non-synonymous substitutions, whereas theory predicts (and most previous evidence has supported) a relationship only in synonymous changes. We discuss both the practical and theoretical implications of these findings.

Introduction

Variability in rates of molecular evolution is well documented and there is now much evidence to suggest that a strict global molecular clock does not hold (Bousquet et al. 1992; Thomas et al. 2006; Welch, Bininda-Emonds, and Bromham 2008). Furthermore, it has been demonstrated that substitution rates can be affected systematically by certain species characteristics; these include ecological factors such as environmental energy (Davies et al. 2004), aspects of evolutionary history such as population size (Woolfit and Bromham 2005) or life history traits such as body size (Bromham, Rambaut, and Harvey 1996). One of the most prominent explanations for variation in substitution rates between lineages is differences in species' generation times. The generation time (GT) hypothesis states that species with shorter generation times should have a greater rate of mutation per year, as they will copy their genomes more frequently and therefore may accrue more DNA replication errors per unit time.

The GT hypothesis stems from observations in early DNA hybridisation studies, where differences in generation time were proposed to explain the finding that rates of molecular evolution for DNA sequences in rodents appeared to be much faster than those found in primates (Laird, McConaughy, and McCarthy 1969; Kohne 1970). This was in contrast to the initial and somewhat surprising observation of a 'molecular clock' in amino acid sequence evolution (Zuckerandl and Pauling 1965). In protein coding sequences, the GT effect should be observed in synonymous substitutions since these are influenced predominantly by the underlying mutation rate (Kimura and Ohta 1971; Ohta and Kimura 1971; Ohta 1972). Non-synonymous substitutions, however, are more likely to be under selection, and theory suggests that the rate of non-synonymous substitution should be influenced not only by the underlying mutation rate, but also by the effective population size (Kimura and Ohta 1971; Ohta and Kimura 1971; Ohta 1972). This is because mutations of small selective effect are expected to go to fixation more frequently in small populations due to genetic drift. Since species with longer generation times (and thus a slower accrual of copy-error mutations) also tend to have smaller N_e (and thus higher fixation rates), it has been suggested that in many cases these two effects will cancel each other out, making the relationship between GT and substitution rate less predictable for non-synonymous substitutions (Ohta and Kimura 1971; Ohta 1972; Ohta 1993; Gillespie 1995; Ohta and Gillespie 1996).

These predictions have been borne out by a number of studies of molecular evolution in vertebrates. A GT effect has been observed for synonymous substitutions in mammals, birds and reptiles (Li and Tanimura 1987; Ohta 1993; Mooers and Harvey 1994; Bromham, Rambaut, and Harvey 1996; Bromham 2002; Nabholz, Glemin, and Galtier 2008; Welch, Bininda-Emonds, and Bromham 2008), while non-synonymous substitutions and rRNAs show rate variation (Ohta and Gillespie 1996; Smith and Eyre-Walker 2003) but far less dependency on life history traits such as GT (Bromham, Rambaut, and Harvey

1996; Gissi et al. 2000; Spradling, Hafner, and Demastes 2001; Welch, Bininda-Emonds, and Bromham 2008; but see Nabholz, Glemin, and Galtier 2008; Gillooly, McCoy, and Allen 2007). Furthermore, similar results have been observed in plants, where in both monocots and dicots, DNA substitution rates are found to be faster in annual species than in related woody perennials (Laroche et al. 1997; Ainouche and Bayer 1999; Laroche and Bousquet 1999; Andreasen and Baldwin 2001; Smith and Donoghue 2008) and in monocots, minimum generation time (time to flowering) appears also to be related to rates of molecular evolution (Gaut et al. 1996; Gaut et al. 1997).

However, despite evidence that provides support for a GT effect, a number of other life history traits have also been put forward to explain the observed differences in substitution rates. This is because, particularly in vertebrates, many life history traits co-vary strongly with each other (for example, a mammal with a short generation time is also likely to have a smaller body size, faster metabolism, higher fecundity and larger population size). Other prominent explanatory variables include metabolic rate (Martin and Palumbi 1993), DNA repair efficiency (Britten 1986), fecundity and longevity (Nabholz, Glemin, and Galtier 2008; Welch, Bininda-Emonds, and Bromham 2008) and the number of developmental germ-line cell divisions (Goetting-Minesky and Makova 2006). Teasing apart the causal effects of different life history traits on rates of molecular evolution in vertebrates is a difficult task, and partial correlations between life history traits in mammals have provided support not only for generation time, but also body size, fecundity and longevity (Bromham, Rambaut, and Harvey 1996; Nabholz, Glemin, and Galtier 2008; Welch, Bininda-Emonds, and Bromham 2008).

As yet, there have been no comprehensive studies examining the GT effect in non-vertebrate metazoans. Invertebrates, though a paraphyletic assemblage, are a useful group in which to investigate the GT effect. The relationships between the different life history traits, such as size, generation time, metabolic rate and longevity are thought to be more variable in invertebrates than in most vertebrate taxa (see Discussion), and this may help to tease out the possible confounding factors which could cause an association between generation time and substitution rates. In this study, we set out to investigate whether a GT effect on substitution rates might be operating in invertebrate metazoans, using a phylogenetic comparative approach. We collected DNA sequences and generation time data for over 300 invertebrate species across 8 different phyla and 15 different mitochondrial and nuclear genes. We then tested for an association between rates of molecular evolution and GT using phylogenetically independent comparisons, and both non-parametric and parametric statistics. We found evidence that invertebrate eumetazoan species with shorter generation times have faster rates of molecular evolution, in ribosomal RNA genes in mitochondrial and nuclear sequences and in non-synonymous substitutions and four-fold degenerate transversions in protein-coding mitochondrial genes.

Methods

Data collection

GT measurements for invertebrate Eumetazoa (including arthropods, nematodes, molluscs, annelids, platyhelminthes, cnidarians, echinoderms and urochordates) were gathered from the literature (see Supplementary Information for full details). Our preferred index of GT was the average generation time in days. Where this was unavailable, estimates of developmental time were used, e.g., age at sexual maturity or first reproduction. However, such measurements were not used for groups known to undergo phenomena such as diapause, for example some terrestrial arthropods.

We aimed to maximize the statistical power of our analysis by balancing the number of comparisons we could use with the amount of DNA sequence data available for each comparison. Consequently, we compiled GT data for all invertebrate species for which the whole mitochondrial genome had been sequenced available from Genbank (ncbi.nlm.nih.gov). This dataset consisted of 214 species with both GT measurements and sequence data (including rRNAs, but excluding tRNAs, ATP6 and ATP8, which could not be aligned between phyla). In addition, to investigate the GT effect in the nuclear genome, we collected a separate dataset comprising 113 species with two nuclear rRNA sequences (28S and 18S). We were unable to obtain sufficient data to test for a GT effect in nuclear protein coding genes.

Selection of phylogenetically independent pairs

The comparative analyses in this study used phylogenetically independent sister pairs (see Felsenstein (1985), Harvey and Pagel (1991), Bromham, Rambaut, and Harvey (1996) and Welch and Waxman (2008)). Because species may share similar trait and rate values as a result of shared ancestry, rather than separate instances of correlated evolutionary change, a failure to account for phylogeny can lead to the same evolutionary changes being included in more than one data-point. Such pseudoreplication can yield spurious evidence of an association between variables.

The number of independent pairs we were able to choose was limited by continued uncertainty about the taxonomy of many large groups of Eumetazoa. In addition, we also needed pairs to be both sufficiently deep, for differences in substitution rates to be reliably detectable (Welch and Waxman 2008) and sufficiently shallow, to avoid saturation. Nevertheless, we were able to choose 54 comparisons for the mitochondrial data set (comprising 27 arthropods, 7 molluscs, 6 platyhelminthes, 5 nematodes, 4 cnidarians, 2 annelids, 2 echinoderms and 1 urochordate), and 20 for the nuclear genes (comprising 6 molluscs, 5 arthropods, 4 annelids, 2 platyhelminthes and 2 nematodes). These pairs encompassed 8 different phyla, including representatives of the major bilaterian superorders (Ecdysozoa, Lophotrochozoa, and invertebrate Deuterostomia), and a small number of pairs from the Cnidaria. The

Supplementary Information contains full details of all pairs, including the taxonomic hypotheses on which the assumption of independence was based.

Substitution rate estimation

All sequences were aligned by eye in Se-AL v2.0 (Rambaut 1996), excluding any highly variable regions that could not be aligned with confidence. Species pairs were then grouped with another pair, or with a single outgroup species of suitable distance, for branch length estimation. For the primary results, all genes of each sequence type (mitochondrial rRNA, mitochondrial protein-coding and nuclear rRNA) were concatenated for rate estimation as follows: 12S+16S; COI+COII+COIII+CYTB+ND1+ND2+ND3+ND4+ND4L+ND5+ND6 and 18S+28S. However, to test the consistency of any effect across the genome, we also split the protein alignments into separate genes, or, for very short genes, gene pairs (ND2+ND3; ND4+ND4L; ND5+ND6).

All molecular branch lengths were estimated using maximum likelihood in PAML v 4.0 (Yang 2007). For rRNA genes, the appropriate substitution model for each pair was determined in Modeltest v3.6 (Posada and Crandall 1998), using the Akaike Information Criterion, which is generally superior to standard hierarchical likelihood ratio tests (Posada and Buckley 2004). For protein-coding genes, we used the recently-developed LG amino-acid replacement matrix of Le and Gascuel (2008), with gamma distributed rates across sites. To translate the sequences, the source code for PAML was altered to implement the variant mitochondrial codes for Platyhelminthes (Garey and Wolstenholme 1989; Ohama et al. 1990; Telford et al. 2000).

In addition to the amino-acid substitution rates, we also set out to estimate synonymous substitution rates in protein-coding genes using the codon-based model of Goldman and Yang (1994). However, synonymous sites were highly saturated for almost every pair in our data set (53/54), making estimates of synonymous rate highly unreliable (codon-based estimates of amino-acid-changing rate remained very close to those obtained from the translated sequences). Furthermore, data to construct a sufficient number of shallower pairs, which are less likely to be saturated, were not available. Therefore, in order to investigate the effects of GT on synonymous substitution rates, given the problems of saturation at synonymous sites, we considered only transversions (which occur at a slower rate) at fourfold degenerate sites at codons that were conserved across the comparison pair and outgroup(s). This removes the effects of transition substitutions from the estimate of substitution rate, which are likely to reach saturation significantly more quickly than transversions. Parametric statistics could not be performed for this dataset, because sequence lengths differed substantially between pairs, with rapidly evolving pairs having fewer conserved codons. This clearly violates the assumptions of homogeneous variance for the linear regression, and is difficult to correct for in a principled way. Nevertheless, non-

parametric tests could still be used (see below). Details of all data are given in Table 1 of the Supplementary Information.

Statistical analysis

To test for significant variation in substitution rates between the members of each comparison pair, we used Likelihood Ratio Tests, comparing the fit of a two-rate model (in which the pair had a common substitution rate, and the outgroup species another rate) to a three-rate model (in which both pair members and the outgroup had separate rates). Twice the difference in log likelihood was then compared to a Chi-square distribution, with one degree of freedom. Z-tests were employed to test whether this rate variation applied across the dataset as a whole (Whitlock 2005).

To test for a relationship between GT and substitution rate, for each pair we calculated the contrast in generation time as the log ratio of the GT measurements for the two species (i.e. $\ln(GT_1/GT_2)$), and the contrast in substitution rate as the log ratio of their molecular branch lengths (i.e. $\ln(BL_1/BL_2)$). We first used a non-parametric two-tailed sign test to test for a relationship across the dataset in the product of the two variables: $\ln(GT_1/GT_2) \times \ln(BL_1/BL_2)$. For this test, a significant excess of negative signs indicates that increases in GT tend to be associated with decreases in species substitution rate.

As a more powerful test of the GT effect, we also used parametric linear regression forced through the origin (see Felsenstein (1985); Garland Jr., Harvey, and Ives (1992)). To check that the assumptions of this test were met (e.g. standardised variance across contrasts), we used the methods of Freckleton (2000), Garland Jr., Harvey, and Ives (1992), and Welch and Waxman (2008), and the suite of regression diagnostics implemented in R (R Development Core Team 2008). To standardise the variance across contrasts, it is usually necessary to weight each contrast by some measure of the pair's divergence time, which serves to correct for the fact that more distantly related pairs are likely to be associated with more evolutionary change, and so generate contrasts of larger magnitude (Felsenstein 1985; Garland Jr., Harvey, and Ives 1992). For this purpose, we used the summed branch lengths for the pair, and found that dividing each contrast by $(BL_1+BL_2)^{1/4}$ gave a good fit for both GT and rate contrasts.

To assess whether our results applied consistently across taxonomic groups, we formally compared the strength of the GT effect in the two superphyla with sufficient comparisons, namely the Ecdysozoa and Lophotrochozoa. For this purpose, we used the common slope test of Warton and Weber (2002), as implemented in the *smatr* package in R (Warton and Ormerod 2007). This test uses Standardized Major Axis Regression (more appropriate for the purpose of comparing slopes) and compares the fit of a single regression line applied to both Lophotrochozoan and Ecdysozoan comparisons, to a model in which each group is allowed its own slope.

Results

Evidence of rate variation

Using triplet likelihood ratio tests we found evidence of significant substitution rate variation across our data set within all sequence types. For the nuclear rRNAs, significant variation at the 5% level was observed in a fifth (4/20) of all comparisons, while for the mitochondrial sequences, significant variation was observed in 43% (23/54) of comparisons for protein coding genes, and in 18% (10/54) for rRNAs. Z-tests (Whitlock 2005), used to combine multiple p-values, yielded highly significant results for the dataset as a whole, in all cases (mitochondrial proteins: $p < 1e-5$; mitochondrial rRNAs: $p < 1e-5$; nuclear rRNAs: $p < 1e-5$).

Evidence for a generation time effect

After accounting for saturation at synonymous sites, we found evidence for a significant negative relationship between generation time and mitochondrial synonymous transversions in invertebrates. A sign test indicated that in more comparison pairs than would be expected by chance, the species with the shorter GT had the faster molecular rate ($p = 0.0175$; Table 1). We found even stronger evidence of a significant negative relationship for amino-acid-changing substitutions in mitochondrial genes ($p = 0.0004$; Table 1). For these non-synonymous substitutions, we were also able to carry out a regression analysis, which too was highly significant ($p = 0.0073$; Table 1; Figure 1a). Furthermore, this analysis was robust to the removal of any or all of the mild outliers evident in Figure 1a. The observed GT effect appeared to be consistent across taxonomic groups, with the slope comparison test showing no significant difference between the Ecdysozoa and Lophotrochozoa ($p = 0.269$; see Table 1). The effect also appeared to be consistent across the mitochondrial genome. All 8 single-gene or gene pair analyses (not shown) yielded negative slopes, and half of these were individually significant (COI, COIII, CYTB, ND2+ND3).

For the mitochondrial rRNAs, the amount of sequence divergence was much smaller, and we had to exclude a single comparison (the Cnidaria pair *Briareum-Pseudoterogorgia*) due to a zero-valued branch length. Nevertheless, there was also evidence for a significant influence of GT on substitution rates in these sequences (Fig. 1b). This was evident from the sign test ($p = 0.024$; Table 1), but the regression was non-significant, and the best-fit slope for the Lophotrochozoa was actually positive (Table 1). However, examination of the regression diagnostics indicated that the assumptions of the regression were poorly met (e.g. Shapiro-Wilks test $p = 0.004$), making this result unreliable. This was found to be due to a single outlier (a shallow comparison pair between the congeners *Octopus ocellatus* and *O. vulgaris*), as identified by a number of diagnostics and evident in Figure 1b. (The sensitivity of parametric tests to shallow pairs, with poorly estimated rate changes, is also expected on theoretical grounds e.g., Welch and Waxman, 2008). The removal of this outlier improved the diagnostics (e.g., Shapiro-Wilks $p = 0.880$),

and gave a significant regression analysis ($p=0.0124$). Both Lophotrochozoan and Ecdysozan slopes were now negative, and not significantly different from each other ($p=0.070$).

Finally, although there were far fewer comparisons, there was also evidence of a GT effect operating in invertebrate nuclear rRNA sequences (Figure 1c). Both the sign test and regression test were highly significant ($p<0.01$ in both cases; Table 1), and again, the slope comparison test indicated no significant differences in the GT effect between the two major superphyla ($p=0.083$).

Discussion

Using a large dataset of 143 species and 15 genes, across 8 different phyla, we have found evidence that differences in generation time can affect rates of molecular evolution in invertebrates. This effect is observed in both nuclear and mitochondrial ribosomal RNAs and in non-synonymous and synonymous substitutions in mitochondrial protein-coding sequences, and is evident despite heterogeneity in quality in our estimates of GT, and inevitable errors in the estimation of molecular branch lengths. This result is important for two reasons. Firstly, the demonstration of a GT effect in animals has thus far been restricted to vertebrates, whereas we show it is a general phenomenon observable across a wide range of animal taxa. Secondly, in much of the previous literature, the GT effect was assumed to be a feature of synonymous changes only (e.g., Gillespie 2001), but we show that it can also be detected for non-synonymous substitution rates.

The GT effect is generally thought to arise from the effect of generation time on the accrual of copy-error mutations. Mechanistic explanations assume that substitution rate depends strongly on the mutation rate, and the mutation rate per year decreases with increasing GT. If every time the genome is copied there is a chance of replication error, then if species with shorter generations undergo more replications per unit time, they should have higher mutation rates. Several factors might weaken the resulting correlation between GT and the mutation rate per year. These include mutations due to unrepaired DNA damage (Cooke et al. 2003); between-lineage variation in replication fidelity (Promislow 1994), the number of germline replications per generation (Bauer and Aquadro 1997; Drake et al. 1998); natural selection acting on the mutation rate (Sniegowski et al. 2000); and the phenomenon of germline mosaicism, where a large fraction of mutations in the nuclear genome appear in just one or two meiotic divisions per organismal generation, thereby obscuring between-lineage variation in the rate of mutation accrued in the preceding mitotic divisions (Drost and Lee 1998). Nevertheless, despite all of these factors, the importance of replication error in the overall mutation rate is attested by both direct estimates (Iyer et al. 2006) and by phenomena such as “male-driven evolution” (Li, Yi, and Makova 2002).

All other factors being equal, an increase in the mutation rate provides an explanation for the observation of greater rates of synonymous substitutions in species with short generation times. Synonymous changes are generally considered to be effectively neutral (Kimura and Ohta 1971; Ohta and Kimura 1971; Ohta 1972), and therefore expected to reflect the underlying mutation rate. Previous failures to observe a GT effect in non-synonymous substitution rates in vertebrates have been explained as the result of a correlation between life history traits, because species with shorter generation times tend to also have larger population sizes. Thus an increase in the rate of nearly neutral mutations may be balanced by an increased effectiveness of selection preventing these mutations going to fixation, so

these two effects on substitution rates may cancel each other out (Ohta and Kimura 1971; Ohta 1972; Ohta 1993; Gillespie 1995; Ohta and Gillespie 1996). In contrast to most of the vertebrate results, however, we do find evidence of a GT effect in non-synonymous substitutions, and this appears to be no less strong than the effect in synonymous sites. This suggests that a “cancelling out” of generation time and N_e is not occurring for these sequences in these taxa. Why not?

One possibility is that Ohta’s predicted cancelling out of N_e and GT for non-synonymous substitutions relies on both the proportion of effectively neutral mutations and the generation time being inversely proportional to population size to exactly the same extent. If, however, this is not the case, and generation time declines rapidly with population size, but the fraction of effectively neutral mutations declines more slowly, then we would still expect to observe a GT effect, even if the nearly neutral theory holds. While a direct correlation between N_e and GT in vertebrates may be a reasonable assumption (Nei and Graur 1984; Chao and Carr 1993), the extent to which these traits correlate within invertebrates is not well documented, as the published studies contain only a few measurements for the genus *Drosophila*.

If GT does scale widely with N_e across metazoan species, there are still a number of ways that a GT effect may be observed in non-synonymous sites. For one, substitutions at non-synonymous sites may not all be weakly deleterious. If a significant proportion of non-synonymous substitutions are strictly neutral, then their rate of fixation should be independent of the population size, and instead reflect the underlying mutation rate (Kimura and Ohta 1971; Ohta 1972), thus generating a relationship between GT and the non-synonymous substitution rate. This might appear unlikely for our data, as we are analysing highly conserved housekeeping genes, the sites in which are likely to be under strong selection. However, a GT effect might still be observed so long as all the substitutions that do occur are strictly neutral (however few there may be). A second possibility is that most of the substitutions we are observing are adaptive rather than weakly deleterious. There is indeed evidence of high rates of adaptive substitution in some species of *Drosophila* (Eyre-Walker 2006). In this case, the non-synonymous substitution rate would be expected to increase with N_e , as the fixation of adaptive substitutions is expected to be more efficient in larger populations. Consequently, if GT was inversely proportional to N_e , we might observe a ‘generation time’ effect for non-synonymous sites as a result of differences in N_e rather than generation time. A GT effect that is stronger in selected than non-selected sites might suggest a role for adaptive molecular evolution proceeding more rapidly in lineages with shorter generations. However, the lack of power in the synonymous transversions analysis prevents us from testing this rigorously, and in any case, an explanation based on mutation rates is more parsimonious.

Alternatively, it could be that the assumptions underlying Ohta and Kimura's explanation are violated in quite a different way. One key supposition of the nearly neutral theory is that substitutions take place independently of one another. However, for species with large N_e and tight linkage between sites, linked selection (genetic draft or hitchhiking) may be a stronger stochastic force in molecular evolution than genetic drift (Maynard Smith and Haigh 1974; Gillespie 2001). If this is so, then neutral and nearly neutral mutations may be dragged to fixation because they are linked to adaptive substitutions. Under these conditions, while a GT effect is still expected to operate for neutral mutation rates, genetic draft is predicted to remove the effects of population size on the fixation of nearly neutral mutations (their fixation would instead depend on the rate of strongly-selected adaptive substitutions per generation) (Gillespie 2001). Consequently, the effects of N_e would no longer cancel out the effects of GT on substitution rates, and a GT effect would be expected in rates of non-synonymous substitution (Gillespie 2001). Although Gillespie (2001) hypothesised that the rate of adaptive substitution per generation might be inversely proportional to GT (removing any GT effect under draft) in order to account for the widely-assumed lack of a GT effect in proteins, our results would suggest that this cancellation may not apply.

Support for the genetic draft hypothesis is particularly strong in invertebrate taxa. Many invertebrate species are likely to have relatively high effective population sizes (Lynch and Conery 2003), and substitutions in mitochondrial sequences in particular are likely to be tightly linked (due to low or absent recombination) (Ballard and Whitlock 2004). In addition, draft relies on adaptive substitution occurring at a non-negligible rate (Gillespie 2001), and comparisons of polymorphism and divergence do suggest that rates of adaptive substitution are substantially higher in invertebrates than in vertebrates (Bazin, Glemin, and Galtier 2006; Eyre-Walker 2006; Meiklejohn, Montooth, and Rand 2007). Furthermore, recent studies have shown that levels of mitochondrial polymorphism across invertebrates do not appear to change with N_e , as they would be expected to under the nearly neutral theory (Bazin, Glemin, and Galtier 2006; Meiklejohn, Montooth, and Rand 2007). This is in contrast to results in vertebrates (Mulligan, Kitchen, and Miyamoto 2006; Piganeau and Eyre-Walker 2008), which have much smaller population sizes, and where the effects of genetic drift would be expected to have a greater influence than draft on substitution rates (Gillespie 2001).

There are consequently several possible explanations for the observed GT effect in invertebrate non-synonymous sites. While the case for GT as a true causal factor is strong, it is important to acknowledge that many other factors have been proposed as predictors of the mutation rate (e.g., body mass, longevity, fecundity and metabolic rate) (Britten 1986; Martin and Palumbi 1993; Bromham, Rambaut, and Harvey 1996; Gillooly et al. 2005; Nabholz, Glemin, and Galtier 2008; Welch, Bininda-Emonds, and Bromham 2008; Bromham 2009). Recent analyses suggest that GT might not be the strongest of these predictors in mammals (Nabholz, Glemin, and Galtier 2008; Welch, Bininda-Emonds, and Bromham

2008), but strong life history correlations between GT and other proposed factors make all such results difficult to interpret. The extent to which these life history traits covary in invertebrates is less well known but it is likely to be less tightly constrained than it is in vertebrates (Thomas et al. 2006). For example, the relationship between body size and GT in ectotherms is also likely to be significantly affected by temperature (environmental and developmental) as well as other related factors such as season length, resource availability and latitude (Olive 1995; Huntley and Lopez 1992; Chown and Gaston 1999; Chown and Klok, 2003). If life history correlations are indeed less strong in invertebrates, then this is consistent with the failure of other life history traits, such as body size and metabolic rate, to predict invertebrate substitution rate (Thomas et al. 2006; Lanfear et al. 2007). However, the failure to observe a correlation can always be attributed to lack of power, a particularly problematic issue in the study of molecular rates (Fontanillas et al. 2007; Welch, Bininda-Emonds, and Bromham 2008; Welch and Waxman, 2008). Indeed, yet another possible explanation for the differences in results between vertebrates and invertebrates could simply be that invertebrate comparison pairs in published studies tend to be deeper and therefore more divergent.

The results reported here have important implications not only for understanding the drivers of molecular evolution in metazoans, but also for the growing use of molecular data in biology. Regardless of the possible causes, our results imply that the “protein molecular clock” of Zuckerkandl and Pauling (1965) may be a taxonomically restricted phenomenon. Although assumptions of rate constancy in molecular dating are no longer prevalent, the observations of a GT effect in both mitochondrial non-synonymous changes and in mitochondrial and nuclear rRNA genes demonstrate that variation in rates of substitution may not only be widespread but systematic. This is relevant to molecular phylogenetic and dating methods that allow rates of molecular evolution to vary between lineages, as it has the potential to cause bias in molecular dates rather than simply adding noise to date estimates. However, while such systematic correlations of substitution rate may complicate models of rate variation in molecular evolution, they may also offer a potential future solution: if we can identify strong correlates of rate variation, then it may be possible to use biological characteristics such as generation time to inform model choice in phylogenetic reconstruction and molecular dating analyses. Consequently, the practical benefits of the molecular clock need not be lost, because a widely applicable GT effect could be exploited as *a priori* information in molecular dating studies.

Supplementary Information

Full details of the comparison pairs used in the analysis, including the taxonomy on which the hypothesis of phylogenetic independence is based, the Generation Time data with details of sources, details of the sequence data, selected substitution models and molecular branch lengths, and results from the Likelihood Ratio Tests of rate heterogeneity. Supplementary Table 1: The full mitochondrial genome data set; Supplementary Table 2: The nuclear rRNA data set.

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank Damhnait McHugh, Jay Rosenheim and Arne Skorping for very kindly providing generation time data; Andrea Betancourt, Adam Eyre-Walker, Meg Woolfit, Nicolas Galtier and two anonymous reviewers for detailed and helpful comments on the manuscript; Adam Eyre-Walker and Gwenael Piganeau for access to unpublished data and Mark Blaxter, Brian Charlesworth, John Trueman, Andrew Rambaut, David Warton and David Waxman for general assistance.

References

- Ainouche, A. K., and R. J. Bayer. 1999. Phylogenetic relationships in *Lupinus* (Fabaceae: Papilionoideae) based on internal transcribed spacer sequences (ITS) of nuclear ribosomal DNA. *Am. J. Bot.* **86**:590.
- Andreasen, K., and B. G. Baldwin. 2001. Unequal evolutionary rates between annual and perennial lineages of checker mallows (*Sidalcea*, Malvaceae): evidence from 18S-26S rDNA internal and external transcribed spacers. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **18**:936-944.
- Ballard, J. W. O., and M. C. Whitlock. 2004. The incomplete natural history of mitochondria. *Mol. Ecol.* **13**:729-744.
- Bauer, V. L., and C. F. Aquadro. 1997. Rates of DNA Sequence Evolution are Not Sex Biased in *Drosophila melanogaster* and *D. simulans*. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **14**:1252-1257.
- Bazin, E., S. Glemin, and N. Galtier. 2006. Population Size Does Not Influence Mitochondrial Genetic Diversity in Animals. *Science* **312**:570-572.
- Bousquet, J., S. H. Strauss, A. H. Doerksen, and R. A. Price. 1992. Extensive variation in evolutionary rate of rbcL gene sequences among seed plants. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **89**:7844-7848.
- Britten, R. J. 1986. Rates of DNA sequence evolution differ between taxonomic groups. *Science* **231**:1393-1398.
- Bromham L (2009) Why do species differ in their rate of molecular evolution? *Biol. Lett.* **5**:401-404
- Bromham, L. 2002. Molecular clocks in reptiles: life history influences rate of molecular evolution. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **19**:302-309.
- Bromham, L., A. Rambaut, and P. H. Harvey. 1996. Determinants of rate variation in mammalian DNA sequence evolution. *J. Mol. Evol.* **43**:610-621.
- Chao, L., and D. E. Carr. 1993. The Molecular Clock and the Relationship between Population Size and Generation Time. *Evolution* **47**:688-690.
- Chown, S. L. and Gaston, K. J. 1999. Exploring links between physiology and ecology at macro scales: the role of respiratory metabolism in insects. *Biol. Rev.* **74**:87-120.
- Chown, S. L. and Klok, C. J. 2003. Altitudinal body size clines: latitudinal effects associated with changing seasonality. *Ecography* **26**:445-455.
- Cooke, M. S., M. D. Evans, M. Dizdaroglu, and J. Lunec. 2003. Oxidative DNA damage: mechanisms, mutation, and disease. *FASEB* **17**:1195-1214.
- Davies, T. J., V. Savolainen, M. W. Chase, J. Moat, and T. G. Barraclough. 2004. Environmental energy and evolutionary rates in flowering plants. *Proc. Roy. Soc. Lond. B* **271**:2195-2200.
- Drake, J. W., B. Charlesworth, D. Charlesworth, and J. F. Crow. 1998. Rates of spontaneous mutation. *Genetics* **148**:1667-1686.

- Drost, J. B., and W. R. Lee. 1998. The developmental basis for germline mosaicism in mouse and *Drosophila melanogaster*. *Genetics* **102/103**:421-443.
- Eyre-Walker, A. 2006. The genomic rate of adaptive evolution. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **21**:571-575.
- Felsenstein, J. 1985. Phylogenies and the Comparative Method. *Am. Nat.* **125**:1-15.
- Fontanillas, E., Welch, J. J., Thomas, J. A., and Bromham, L. 2007. The influence of body size and net diversification rate on molecular evolution during the radiation of animal phyla. *BMC Evol. Biol.*, **7**:95–107.
- Freckleton, R. P. 2000. Phylogenetic tests of ecological and evolutionary hypothesis: checking for phylogenetic independence. *Functional Ecology* **14**:129-134.
- Garey, J. R., and D. R. Wolstenholme. 1989. Platyhelminth mitochondrial DNA: evidence for early evolutionary origin of a tRNA (serAGN) that contains a dihydrouridine arm replacement loop, and of serine-specifying AGA and AGG codons. *J. Mol. Evol.* **28**:374-387.
- Garland Jr., T., P. H. Harvey, and A. R. Ives. 1992. Procedures for the analysis of comparative data using phylogenetically independent contrasts. *Syst. Biol.* **41**:18-32.
- Gaut, B. S., L. G. Clark, J. F. Wendel, and S. V. Muse. 1997. Comparisons of the molecular evolutionary process at rbcL and ndhF in the grass family (Poaceae). *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **14**:769-777.
- Gaut, B. S., B. R. Morton, B. C. McCaig, and M. T. Clegg. 1996. Substitution rate comparisons between grasses and palms: synonymous rate differences at the nuclear gene Adh parallel rate differences at the plastid gene rbcL. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **93**:10274-10279.
- Gillespie, J. H. 1995. On Ohta's hypothesis: Most amino-acid substitutions are deleterious. *J. Mol. Evol.* **40**:64-69.
- Gillespie, J. H. 2001. Is the population size of a species relevant to its evolution? *Evolution* **55**:2161-2169.
- Gillooly, J. F., A. P. Allen, G. B. West, and J. H. Brown. 2005. The rate of DNA evolution: effects of body size and temperature on the molecular clock. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **102**:140-145.
- Gillooly, J. F., M. W. McCoy, and A. P. Allen. 2007. Effects of metabolic rate on protein evolution. *Biol. Lett.* **3**:655–659
- Gissi, C., A. Reyes, G. Pesole, and C. Saccone. 2000. Lineage-Specific Evolutionary Rate in Mammalian mtDNA. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **17**:1022-1031.
- Goetting-Minesky, M. P., and K. D. Makova. 2006. Mammalian Male Mutation Bias: Impacts of Generation Time and Regional Variation in Substitution Rates. *J. Mol. Evol.* **63**:537-544.
- Goldman, N., and Z. Yang. 1994. A codon-based model of nucleotide substitution for protein-coding DNA sequences. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **11**:725-736.
- Harvey, P. H., and M. D. Pagel. 1991. *The Comparative Method in Evolutionary Biology*. Oxford University Press, Oxford.

- Huntley, M. E. and Lopez, M. D. G. 1992. Temperature-dependent production of marine copepods: A global synthesis. *Am. Nat.* **40**:201–242.
- Iyer, R. R., A. Pluciennik, V. Burdett, and P. L. Modrich. 2006. DNA Mismatch Repair: Functions and Mechanisms. *Chem. Rev.* **106**:302–323.
- Kimura, M., and T. Ohta. 1971. On the Rate of Molecular Evolution. *J. Mol. Evol.* **1**:1-17.
- Kohne, D. E. 1970. Evolution of higher organism DNA. *Quart. Rev. Biophys.* **3**:327-375.
- Laird, C., B. L. McConaughy, and B. J. McCarthy. 1969. Rate of fixation of nucleotide substitutions in evolution. *Nature* **224**:149-154.
- Lanfear, R., J. A. Thomas, J. J. Welch, and L. Bromham. 2007. Metabolic rate does not calibrate the molecular clock. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **104**:15388-15393.
- Laroche, J., and J. Bousquet. 1999. Evolution of the mitochondrial rps3 intron in perennial and annual angiosperms and homology to nad5 intron 1. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **16**:441-452.
- Laroche, J., P. Li, L. Maggia, and J. Bousquet. 1997. Molecular evolution of angiosperm mitochondrial introns and exons. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **94**:5722-5727.
- Le, S. Q., and O. Gascuel. 2008. An Improved General Amino Acid Replacement Matrix. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **25**:1307-1320.
- Li, W. H., and M. Tanimura. 1987. The molecular clock runs more slowly in man than in apes and monkeys. *Nature* **326**:93-96.
- Li, W. H., S. Yi, and K. D. Makova. 2002. Male-driven evolution. *Curr. Opin. Genet. Dev.* **12**:650-656.
- Lynch, M., and J. S. Conery. 2003. The Origins of Genome Complexity. *Science* **302**:1401-1404.
- Martin, A. P., and S. R. Palumbi. 1993. Body size, metabolic rate, generation time, and the molecular clock. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **90**:4087-4091.
- Maynard Smith, J., and J. Haigh. 1974. The hitch-hiking effect of a favourable gene. *Gen. Res. Camb.* **23**:23-35.
- Meiklejohn, C. D., K. L. Montooth, and D. M. Rand. 2007. Positive and negative selection on the mitochondrial genome. *Trends in Genetics* **23**:259-263.
- Mooers, A. O., and P. H. Harvey. 1994. Metabolic rate, generation time, and the rate of molecular evolution in birds. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* **3**:344-350.
- Mulligan, C. J., A. Kitchen, and M. M. Miyamoto. 2006. Comment on "Population Size Does Not Influence Mitochondrial Genetic Diversity in Animals". *Science* **314**:1390a.
- Nabholz, B., S. Glemin, and N. Galtier. 2008. Strong Variations of Mitochondrial Mutation Rate across Mammals - the Longevity Hypothesis. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **25**:120-130.
- Nei, M., and D. Graur. 1984. Extent of protein polymorphism and the neutral mutation theory. *Evol. Biol.* **17**:73-118.
- Ohama, T., S. Osawa, K. Watanabe, and T. H. Jukes. 1990. Evolution of the mitochondrial genetic code. IV. AAA as an asparagine codon in some animal mitochondria. *J. Mol. Evol.* **30**:329-332.

- Ohta, T. 1972. Evolutionary Rate of Cistrons and DNA Divergence. *J. Mol. Evol.* **1**:150-157.
- Ohta, T. 1993. An examination of the generation-time effect on molecular evolution. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **90**:10676-10680.
- Ohta, T., and J. H. Gillespie. 1996. Development of Neutral and Nearly Neutral Theories. *Theor. Pop. Biol.* **49**:128-142.
- Ohta, T., and M. Kimura. 1971. On the Constancy of the Evolutionary Rate of Cistrons. *J. Mol. Evol.* **1**:18-25.
- Olive, P. J. W. 1995. Annual breeding cycles in marine invertebrates and environmental temperature: probing the proximate and ultimate causes of reproductive synchronicity. *J. Therm. Biol.* **20**:79-90
- Piganeau, G., and A. Eyre-Walker. 2009. Variation in the Effective Population Size of Mitochondrial DNA. *PLoS One.* **4**, e4396.
- Posada, D., and T. R. Buckley. 2004. Model selection and model averaging in phylogenetics: advantages of the AIC and Bayesian approaches over likelihood ratio tests. *Syst. Biol.* **53**:793-808.
- Posada, D., and K. A. Crandall. 1998. Modeltest: testing the model of DNA substitution. *Bioinformatics* **14**:817-818.
- Promislow, D. E. 1994. DNA repair and the evolution of longevity: a critical analysis. *J. Theor. Biol.* **170**:291-300.
- R-Development-Core-Team. 2008. R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.
- Rambaut, A. 1996. Se-AL Sequence Alignment, available at <http://tree.bio.ed.ac.uk/software.html>.
- Smith, N. G., and A. Eyre-Walker. 2003. Partitioning the variation in mammalian substitution rates. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **20**:10-17.
- Smith, S. A., and M. J. Donoghue. 2008. Rates of Molecular Evolution Are Linked to Life History in Flowering Plants. *Science* **322**:86-89.
- Sniegowski, P. D., P. D. Gerrish, T. Johnson, and A. Shaver. 2000. The causes of mutation rates: separating causes from consequences. *BioEssays* **22**:1057-1066.
- Spradling, T. A., M. S. Hafner, and J. W. Demastes. 2001. Differences in rate of Cytochrome-b evolution among species of rodents. *Journal of Mammalogy* **82**:65-80.
- Telford, M. J., E. A. Herniou, R. B. Russell, and D. T. Littlewood. 2000. Changes in mitochondrial genetic codes as phylogenetic characters: two examples from the flatworms. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA.* **97**:11359-11364.
- Thomas, J. A., J. J. Welch, M. Woolfit, and L. Bromham. 2006. There is no universal molecular clock in invertebrates but rate variation does not scale with body size. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **103**:7366-7371.
- Warton, D. I., and J. Ormerod. 2007. SMATR package, version 2.1, available at: <http://web.maths.unsw.edu.au/~dwarton>.

- Warton, D. I., and N. C. Weber. 2002. Common slope tests for bivariate structural relationships. *Biometrical Journal* **44**:161–174.
- Welch, J. J., O. R. Bininda-Emonds, and L. Bromham. 2008. Correlates of substitution rate variation in mammalian protein-coding sequences. *BMC Evol. Biol.* **8**:53-64.
- Welch, J. J., and D. Waxman. 2008. Calculating independent contrasts for the comparative study of substitution rates. *J. Theor. Biol.* **251**:667-678.
- Whitlock, M. C. 2005. Combining probability from independent tests: the weighted Z-method is superior to Fisher's approach. *J. Evol. Biol.* **18**:1368-1373.
- Woolfit, M., and L. Bromham. 2005. Population size and molecular evolution on islands. *Proc. Roy. Soc. Lond. B* **272**:2277-2282.
- Yang, Z. 2007. PAML 4: Phylogenetic Analysis by Maximum Likelihood. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **24**:1586–1591.
- Zuckerkandl, E., and L. Pauling. 1965. Evolutionary Divergence and Convergence in Proteins. Pp. 97-166 *in* V. Bryson, and H. J. Vogel, eds. *Evolving Genes and Proteins*. Academic, New York.

Table 1: The invertebrate GT effect

Dataset		Sign test		Regression			Slope comparison		
Sequences	<i>n</i>	-ve	<i>p</i>	slope	<i>r</i> ²	<i>p</i>	Ecdy	Loph	<i>p</i>
Mitochondrial synon. tv.	54	35	0.0175*	–	–	–	–	–	–
Mitochondrial proteins	54	39	0.0004**	-0.143	0.128	0.0073**	-0.358	-0.501	0.269
Mitochondrial rRNAs	53	34	0.0241*	-0.124	0.064	0.0658	-0.522	0.540	–
	52†	34	0.0124*	-0.145	0.117	0.0124*	-0.521	-0.284	0.070
Nuclear rRNAs	20	17	0.0026**	-0.162	0.304	0.0096**	-0.465	-0.228	0.083

Notes: * $p < 0.05$; ** $p < 0.01$; † outlier removed; Ecdy: Ecdysozoan pairs; Loph: Lophotrochozoan pairs; synon. tv.: transversions at fourfold degenerate sites in conserved codons.

Figure 1 Legend

Plots of phylogenetically independent sister-pair comparisons of substitution rate, against generation time (GT), with regression lines forced through the origin (Table 1; dotted line shows the regression with the Lophotrochozoan outlier, indicated as ‘*’, removed). The different symbols indicate major taxonomic groups: Ecdysozoa (filled circles); Lophotrochozoa (empty circles); invertebrate Deuterostomia (diamonds); Cnidaria (triangles). Substitution rate estimated from (a) 11 mitochondrial protein-coding genes (the complete complement excluding ATP6 and ATP8); (b) the 2 mitochondrial rRNA-coding genes (12S and 16S); (c) 2 nuclear rRNA-coding genes (18S and 28S).

Figure 1.

